# Characteristics of whitebark pine (*Pinus albicaulis*) growth and defense in response to disturbance

Nick Kichas – Montana State University Sharon Hood – U. S. Forest Service Greg Pederson – U. S. Geological Survey Rick Everett – Salish Kootenai College Dave McWethy – Montana State University













In collaboration with:



# Confederated Salish and Kootenai Tribes Salish Kootenai College Salish & Kootenai Culture Committees

**Rich Jannsen** – CSKT Natural Resource Department

Tony Incashola, Jr. – CSKT Forestry

Jim Durglo – CSKT Forestry

Michael Durglo, Jr. – Tribal Preservation Department



Flathead

Indian

Reservation



Moss Peak



Limited Early Human-Use Sites Intensive Early Human-Use Sites

Three Lakes

20

10

6

30

Kilometers

Rethbow Lake

N

National Bison Range

Twin Lakes





# **Three Lakes Peak**

- 225 whitebark sampled
  - ~ 73% Mortality

For this study: 60 trees (30 live / 30 dead)

## **Boulder**

- 476 whitebark sampled
  - ~ 86% Mortality

For this study: 84 trees (42 live / 42 dead)

72 pairs (144 total trees)



# **Resin Ducts: Important for Defense**





| Oecologia (2010) 164:601–609<br>DOI 10.1007/s00442-010-1683-4   | Tree Physiology 35, 112–123<br>doi:10.1093/treephys/tpu106   |  |  |  |
|---|--|--|--|--|
| PHYSIOLOGICAL ECOLOGY - ORIGINAL PAPER  | Research paper   |  |  |  |
| Importance of resin ducts in reducing ponderosa pine mortality<br>from bark beetle attack   | Differentiation of persistent anatomical defensive structures<br>is costly and determined by nutrient availability and genetic<br>growth-defence constraints   |  |  |  |
| Tree Physiology 35, 1222-1235   | Xoaquín Moreira <sup>1,4</sup> , Rafael Zas <sup>2</sup> , Alejandro Solla <sup>3</sup> and Luis Sampedro <sup>2</sup>   |  |  |  |
| doi:10.1093/treephys/tpv098<br>Research paper   | Article  |  |  |  |
| Ponderosa pine resin defenses and growth: metrics matter  | Contrasting Impacts of Climate and Competition on  |  |  |  |
| Sharon Hood <sup>1,2,3</sup> and Anna Sala <sup>1</sup>   | Fire-Excluded Forest of the Central Sierra Nevada  |  |  |  |
| Oecologia (2014) 174:1283–1292<br>DOI 10.1007/s00442-013-2841-2   | Andrew W. Slack <sup>1,2,*</sup> , Jeffrey M. Kane <sup>1</sup> , Eric E. Knapp <sup>3</sup> and Rosemary L. Sherriff <sup>1,4</sup>   |  |  |  |
| PLANT-MICROBE-ANIMAL INTERACTIONS - ORIGINAL RESEARCH   | Ecological Applications, 0(0), 2016, pp. 1–17<br>© 2016 by the Ecological Society of America   |  |  |  |
| Resin duct characteristics associated with tree resistance to bark<br>beetles across lodgepole and limber pines   | Fortifying the forest: thinning and burning increase resistance to a bark beetle outbreak and promote forest resilience<br>Sharon M. Hood, <sup>1,2,3</sup> Stephen Baker, <sup>1</sup> and Anna Sala <sup>2</sup>   |  |  |  |
| ORIGINAL ARTICLE WILEY MICH   | Tree Physiology 35, 107–111<br>doi:10.1093/treephys/tpv015   |  |  |  |
| Anatomical defences against bark beetles relate to degree of<br>historical exposure between species and are allocated<br>independently of chemical defences within trees  | Commentary<br>To grow or defend? Pine seedlings grow less but induce more<br>defences when a key resource is limited   |  |  |  |
| Charles J. Mason <sup>1</sup>   Ken Keefover-Ring <sup>2</sup>   Caterina Villari <sup>3</sup>   Jennifer G. Klutsch <sup>4</sup>  <br>Stephen Cook <sup>5</sup>   Pierluigi Bonello <sup>3</sup>   Nadir Erbilgin <sup>4</sup>   Kenneth F. Raffa <sup>6</sup> | Scott Ferrenberg <sup>1,4,5</sup> , Jeffrey M. Kane <sup>2</sup> and Joseph M. Langenhan <sup>3</sup>  |  |  |  |
| Philip A. Townsend <sup>7</sup>   | New Phytologist Research   |  |  |  |
| Low-severity fire increases tree defense<br>against bark beetle attacks   | Drought predisposes piñon–juniper woodlands to insect attacks and mortality  |  |  |  |
| Sharon Hood, <sup>1,4</sup> Anna Sala, <sup>1</sup> Emily K. Heyerdahl, <sup>2</sup> and Marion Boutin <sup>3</sup>   | Monica L. Gaylord <sup>1</sup> , Thomas E. Kolb <sup>1</sup> , William T. Pockman <sup>2</sup> , Jennifer A. Plaut <sup>2</sup> , Enrico A.Yepez <sup>2,3</sup> ,<br>Alison K. Macalady <sup>4</sup> , Robert E. Pangle <sup>2</sup> and Nate G. McDowell <sup>5</sup> |  |  |  |



### Live



Differences in Physiology (radial growth / resin duct properties)?

### What physiological properties inform survivorship?

H<sub>1</sub>: live whitebark pines will exhibit more rapid and sustained growth than dead whitebark pines, during the overlap of their lifespan (Ferrenberg *et al.* 2014, Hood & Sala 2015, Hood *et al.* 2016).

 $H_2$ : live whitebark pines will have more robust defensive features (increased resinduct size, density, and cumulative area) than dead whitebark pines, during the overlap of their lifespan.

(Kane & Kolb 2010, Ferrenberg et al. 2014, Hood et al. 2015)









# **Duct Production**

### (total # of ducts per annual ring)









# **Duct Size**





# **Duct Area**

# (Sum of duct area per annual ring) Live Dead



# **Duct Density**

### (Total # of ducts per annual ring divided by ring area)

### Live





| ••  | ••  | ••  | ••  | ••  | ••  | ••  |
|-----|-----|-----|-----|-----|-----|-----|
| ••• | ••• | ••• | ••• | ••• | ••• | ••• |



# **Relative Area (%)**

### (Total duct area divided by ring area x 100)

### Live









PC 1: resin duct size, resin duct area, resin duct relative area, duct density

PC 2: growth (RWI), resin duct production

### **Conditional Density Plot**

describes how the conditional distribution of a categorical variable (**Y**) changes over a numerical variable (**X**)



### **Conditional Density Plot**

describes how the conditional distribution of a categorical variable (**Y**) changes over a numerical variable (**X**)



# Summary

• Mean resin duct size and relative duct area were greater in trees that survived recent disturbances.

• Resin duct size and relative duct area were the most important variables for predicting mortality.

First evidence (*to our knowledge*) comparing growth and defense across pairs of live and dead whitebark pine.



Multiple disturbances select for complex growth / defense strategies in whitebark pine.

Important to maintain genetic diversity (buffers against future change).

# Next Steps: Chemical Ecology of Whitebark Pine



# Next Steps: Chemical Ecology of Whitebark Pine



# Next Steps: Chemical Ecology of Whitebark Pine



PC 1:  $\alpha$ -pinene,  $\beta$ -myrcene,  $\delta$ -limonene, sabinene

PC 2:,  $\alpha$ -phellandrene,  $\beta$ -phellandrene,  $\beta$ -ocimene



# **Thank You!**



# **Confederated Salish and Kootenai Tribes**

# Salish Kootenai College

# Salish & Kootenai Culture Committees

Rich Jannsen Tony Incashola, Jr. Jim Durglo Michael Durglo, Jr.

### Advisory Committee David McWethy Gregory Pederson

Richard Everett Sharon Hood

### **Collaborators**

- Emily Heyerdahl
- Robert Keane
- Amy Trowbridge

### Research Assistance

- Danny Stahle
- Cathy Whitlock
- MSU Paleoecology Lab:
  - Pico Alt
  - Peter Billman
  - Buzz Nanavati
  - Christopher Schiller
  - Shelby Sly
  - Barbara Ulrich
  - Matthew Weingart
  - John Wendt

### Field Assistance

- Mckenzie Rides at the Door
- ShiNaasha Pete
- Tamara Birdsbill
- Joesef Andrews
- Derek Snyder
- Catherine Hopstad

### Lab Assistance

- Zachary Gigone
- Aden Norris

# **Questions?**

STA.